



DumGal Against Pylons

Meeting with Colin Gibson, Moffat, 14 December 2015

Present:

Colin Gibson

DumGal against Pylons Members

Alan Jones

Penny Coles

William Crawford

John Thomson

Maureen Johnstone

Iain Milligan

Colin Gibson is a retired director of National Grid and supports the John Muir Trust with technical advice. Colin kindly agreed to meet us and we discussed several issues surrounding the similarities around the Beauly-Denny application and the proposal for Dumfries and Galloway.

Colin was involved in helping the John Muir Trust with examining both the Economic and Technical Needs Cases in the Beauly–Denny power line, especially the costs. There had to be a balance between the capital cost of the project against the cost of constraint payments paid to power generators without the reinforcement. There were three categories of wind farms considered – constructed, those with permission and those at some stage of seeking planning consent. JMT were arguing that to provide a an OHL with design capacity for 60% when the wind farms only generated 25% load capacity over a year was not justified when balanced against the considerable environmental damage of the line. The system integration costs were not outlined fully in the case and these could be of the same order as the capital cost of the project.

Colin felt that all the other possible options had not been fully considered.

Colin lent us a copy of the Economic Needs Case for the Beauly-Denny power line so we can see the style of the document and start to collect data on the areas covered by the report. He endorsed our view that an early Needs Case should be published publicly. The pressure for this foundation document must be maintained before the D&G project progresses.

Colin talked us through the complexity of the different systems governing the production, transmission and supply of electricity. The intermittent nature of some renewables is causing problems for energy security and the high costs of renewables has increased electricity prices resulting in the loss of steel works etc.

Amber Rudd has spoken publicly about the need for some form of system integration cost being levied on all intermittent power generators to help pay for the back up generators that are needed to supply electricity when the intermittent generators are not producing any or only a little electricity.

The security of supply of electricity is problematic with some of the lowest working margins experienced this year.

We discussed the problem of future congestion at Harker with the nuclear power station at Moorside also planning to run a new 400kV OHL into Harker. Other land fall points for a sub sea cable were discussed to overcome future problems of high transfers in some parts of the country.

Colin advised us to read three National Grid key documents:

Future energy scenario papers

Winter running conditions

Ten year statement

The System Operability Paper

IESIS paper

Key actions for DGAP:

Read Colin's list above

Continue to lobby for Needs Case and encourage others to do the same.

Analyse Beaulieu-Denny needs case

- Compare expected generation from wind farms with the generation now in place.
- Look at impact on the local economy. Damage to tourism? Jobs created by the OHL for local people?

Read all Beaulieu-Denny public inquiry paperwork.

Contact JMT for detailed information relating to Beaulieu-Denny.

Meet with Beaulieu-Denny campaign group. Colin has a contact for us to follow up.

15 December 2015